Reproduction of Multiculturalism

By Dr. Abidin Wakano

Reproduction of Multiculturalism in the Development of Information and Communication Technology at Islamic Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia

Abidin Wakano*, Saidin Ernas, Ummu Sai'dah
Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Ambon, Indonesia
Corresponding Email: awakano@iainambon.ac.id

Abstract

In the last decade, the concept of multiculturalism has become one of the ideas of diversity management that has emerged in Islamic campuses in Indonesia, especially those under the Ministry of Religious Affairs. This paper aims to describe how the dynamics of Islamic higher education institutions understand and apply the idea of multiculturalism in the development of Information and Communication Technology. Based on the qualitative studies carried out in three State Islamic Religious Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia, namely IAIN Ambon, UIN Sahid Jakarta and UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh, two important things were found. First, although the idea of multiculturalism emerged from the historical experience of the Western world, it has been adapted as part of academic discourse on Islamic campuses because it is considered relevant to Islamic teachings on diversity. Second, the institutionalization of the idea of multiculturalism in academic systems and life can be seen in three models. The ordinary acceptance model because multiculturalism is not considered an important idea needed by the academic community on a campus, as in the case of UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh. Meanwhile the symbolic acceptance model in which multiculturalism is adapted has been applied at IAIN Ambon, which has openly adapted multiculturalism in the vision and mission of the institution. The substantive model adopted by the academic community at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta has the opportunity to internalize the idea of multiculturalism more strongly and deeply.

Keywords; *multiculturalism, Islamic higher education institutions, information and communication technology*

1. Introduction

Indonesia has been destined as one of the most multicultural nations, consisting of various ethnic, religious, cultural, linguistic and social systems that can live together in a nation-wide life (Hugo, 2015: 259-280). Existing diversity must be maintained and cared for properly, given the development of information and communication technology today is eroding the diversity because it is misused by several parties. According to An'Amta and Mattiro (2017), in fact Indonesia is a phenomenon of pluralistic society that is difficult to find in any part of the world Based on the data, there are around 350 languages, 600 ethnic groups with their respective identities. There are also 6 official religions recognized by the state and hundreds of local religions and beliefs that still live in community systems in various regions.

During the New Order regime, diversity in society was considered a potential conflict that was encountered in hegemonic ways. Especially, in the era of information and communication technology that is so fast. The state performed uniformity by imposing a single national identity (Gerring, Hoffman and Zarecki, 2018: 283-314). However, a number of communal conflicts that occurred in the latter half of the New Order (1998-2004), indicate the failure of the state in managing diversity and differences which had become social and political facts (Klein, 2016). So after the reform, the academic world in Indonesia also worked hard to find the concept of diversity management which is expected to be able to maintain the existence of diversity on the one hand, but also to strengthen and maintain national interests and integrity on the other (Harjatanaya and Hoon, 2020: 18-35).

The process of finding the concept, some of which developed from the values of local wisdom that became the nation's cultural wealth, and some were adopted from theories and concepts that have developed in the social-political discourse in the Western world (Howard, Dickert, Owusu

and Riley, 2018: 497-514). The idea of pluralism, for example, which some time ago drew a lot of criticisms from several parties, because it was considered to nullify the meaning of truth and assume all religions are the same (Samsudin and Zakaria, 2017: 71-80)

Another discourse which is then widely discussed in various seminar forums and adorned various academic works, is the idea of multiculturalism (multiculturalism), which has recently become a public discourse - as if replacing the pluralism discourse discussed earlier. The discussion on pluralism and multiculturalism became more prominent after the various sectarian conflicts that struck Indonesia after the 1998 reform (Hefner, 2019: 375-396). Its advocates consider that the fundamental values contained in multiculturalism are very urgent to be pushed into public awareness, and disseminated as the basis of political policy in managing diversity. In the context of religious life in Indonesia, multiculturalism is needed to build religious awareness that respects differences (Hakim, 2019: 18-29). Through multiculturalism, religions are given the opportunity to live and develop with their own uniqueness. The reciprocity of respect is based on knowledge and understanding of other religions and cultures without making one's own culture a single-hegemonic benchmark for other religions and cultures.

This condition broadens the study of multiculturalism which is considered relevant to the socio-political conditions and development of information and communication technology in Indonesia and provides a conceptual framework that is sufficient to build a nation state on the diversity of religion, ethnicity and culture (Howell, Brown, Brumley, Bryant, Caughey, Cornell and Mhyre, 2018: 275-289). With the awareness of multiculturalism, a multicultural society will be able to carry out patterns of social relations with tolerance and peaceful coexistence while tolerating forms of disparity inherent in each member of the community (pro existence), not with the exception of religious disparity and religious orientation (Melikov and Skorodumova, 2019: 779-784; Wekke, 2016).

A positive conception of multiculturalism has encouraged serious academic and intellectual discussion in higher education institutions, been used as seminar material, become the object of study in study centers, and has even adopted as an institution's vision and mission: government, civil society organizations, and even the vision of higher education institutions (Alfita, Kadiyono, Nguyen, Firdaus, and Wekke, 2019). It seems that Islamic higher education institutions also address this discourse. There are institutions that adapt openly and are institutionalized, although some are still in the process of limited intellectual discourse. Since the early 2000s, religious higher education institutions such as UIN (Stet Islamic University), IAIN (State Institute of Islamic Studies) and STAIN (State College of Islamic Studies) have begun to encourage ideas about Islam and Multiculturalism and the opportunities for institutionalization in Indonesia (Safitri & Efianingrum, 2020). There are at least three Islamic universities that intensely reproduce the idea of multiculturalism, namely Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University (UIN) Jakarta, Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University (UIN) Yogyakarta and Ambon State Islamic Institute (IAIN). While in several other campuses such as UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh, Multiculturalism has yet to be considered a necessary academic discourse.

This phenomenon is an example of how Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia try to find best practices from the process of reproduction of ideas of multiculturalism that are developed and how they are institutionalized in various academic policies, curricula and scientific atmosphere in Islamic higher education institutions in this country (Andriansyah, Taufiqurokhman, and Wekke, 2019: 413-424). Therefore, by comparing the phenomena of IAIN Ambon, UIN Syaruf Hidayatullah Jakarta and UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh, this study aims to examine two important things. *first*, how Islamic Universities understand and develop the idea of multiculturalism, and second, how to institutionalize the idea of multiculturalism in the system and academic life in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia.

2. Methods

To answer these two main questions, the authors have conducted a qualitative study (Rosenthal, 2016: 509-516) in three Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia, namely; IAIN Ambon, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, and UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh. All three have their own uniqueness and are expected to be able to give an idea of how the notion of multiculturalism in the

development of information and communication technology is understood and institutionalized in the academic tradition in the institutions. The three campuses were also chosen with the assumption of representing the profiles of Islamic higher education institutions from three main regions in Indonesia (East, Central and West). The data were collected through observation and interviews (Hammarberg, Kirkman and de Lacey, 2016: 498-501) with a number of informants in Ambon, Jakarta and Banda Aceh, from July through september 2019.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Study of Multiculturalism in the Development of Information and Communication Technology in Indonesia

The study on multiculturalism has developed widely in Indonesia in the last two decades, especially after social conflicts that struck the country during the period 2000-2010, and the pace of development of information and communication technology that is often used as a tool for fighting sheep. Works by several Western theorists such as Will Kymlicka and Biku Parekh have become an important reference in the study of multiculturalism. Likewise is the note of Indonesianists such as Hefner (2019:375-396) who diligently studied the transformation of civil society, and encouraged the idea of multiculturalism as a political discourse of diversity. Since then, various studies on the idea of multiculturalism have become an important scientific discourse in various academic communities.

If observed, the discourse on multiculturalism also briefly surfaced in Western countries. In Britain, debates about the urgency of multiculturalism in managing diversity are seen as providing a place for minority Muslim communities. Mondal's study (2016:3-24) explained the relevance of multiculturalism and universal values of Islam. In praxis, multiculturalism opens up space for minority Muslim communities in Europe to be accepted and recognized, even though it seems to make some conservative leaders uncomfortable. That is why Mondal urged the need for intensive study of Islam and multiculturalism in universities in Europe as one answer to the management of diversity in the future (Mondal, 2016: 3-24). A similar study of the need to develop multiculturalism values for Muslim minorities in India can also be found in the study of Krishan and Chauhan (2016: 283-302).

In Indonesia, studies on multiculturalism are more dominated by multicultural education, which seems increasingly prominent. As seen in the study of Hanurawan and Waterworth (2016) on Multicultural Perspectives in Indonesian Social Studies Education Curriculum. Fattah's study and several other publications on multicultural education, sought to show the need to develop an education system that absorbs the values of multiculturalism. Likewise, various studies that discuss the relevance of multiculturalism to Islamic educational values can be found in the works of Azumardi Azra (2012:1-12), and Amin Abdullah (2014:21-24). These works attempted to offer cultural insights as an important part of the basics of Islamic education.

In line with the studies above, this paper actually takes a different focus, namely mapping more broadly about the thought on multiculturalism developed in various Islamic higher education institutions, and how scientists and leaders of Islamic higher education institutions adapt the conception of multiculturalism in the education system in university. The spirit of Islam as a blessing for the universe presupposes the progressive understanding of inclusive understanding that encourages the Islamic higher education community to have its own perspective on multiculturalism, which can be productively used in the development of Islamic higher education systems, as well as in supporting national development

As mentioned above, the development of multiculturalism developed in Indonesia is not something that emerges suddenly, without certain dynamics guiding it. As a theoretical construction, multiculturalism is presented as an ideological choice that demands the development of a civilized and democratic society. These processes must be seen as a movement of knowledge, politics and social struggle for each other to compete for space in the knowledge space on campus, in society, and in national life. In the context of the institutionalization of values, Piere Bourdieu in Sieweke (2014:22-42) has introduced the concept of habitus and realm to analyze social movements in an increasingly dynamic society, and in the midst of the rapid development of information and communication technology. Using Bourdeu's theoretical framework to analyze the

involvement of individuals in a social dynamic is needed to verify whether the adaptation of ideas of multiculturalism developed in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia occurs because of a free awareness or because it is subject to a dominant social structure, especially by actors in higher education that have certain powers. Ideas about social reproduction can be simplified in three keywords, actors, narratives and interests.

3.2. General Description of the three State Islamic Religious Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia

The three higher education institutions made as objects in this study, namely the Ambon State Islamic Institute (IAIN), the State Islamic University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, and the Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh State Islamic University, are the State Islamic Religious Higher Education Institutions under the Ministry of Religius Affairs, each of which has its own dynamics and characteristics, especially with regard to the academic atmosphere and the institutionalization of multiculturalism ideas that are central in this study. In this section, we will introduce further about the three Islamic higher education institutions and developments to date.

First, the Ambon State Islamic Institute (IAIN), one of the state Islamic religious colleges located in Ambon City, Maluku Province. The history of the establishment of the IAIN Ambon began with the establishment of the Sharia Faculty in 1982 and the Ushuluddin Faculty in 1983 and both were the Filial (branch) Faculty of IAIN Alauddin Makassar. In its status as regional faculties, these institutions tended to have limited space in anticipating the growing demands in the region. The government then issued a permit for IAIN Ambon to become the Ambon State Islamic College (STAIN) in 1997. As an autonomous institution, STAIN Ambon began opening 4 majors and 10 new study programs that continue to develop to date.

In 2006 the STAIN Ambon was transformed into the Ambon State Islamic Institute (IAIN). Since the change in status, IAIN Ambon has begun to establish an institutional vision as an Islamic campus with a multicultural spirit. Many people praised the conception as an important distinction and positioned the IAIN Ambon in a row of Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia. Although many are skeptical and do not agree with the choice. However, Hasbollah Toisuta, the Rector believed that multiculturalism is an objective choice to prepare the pillars of Islamic civilization in Maluku amid religious and ethnic diversity that had triggered conflict and violence. Therefore IAIN Ambon's vision is "Professionals in integrating Islam, science, culture and technology in a multicultural framework by 2032."

Second, Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University (UIN) Jakarta, or commonly known as UIN Sahid, is one of the most popular Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia. The campus is located on the outskirts of the Capital City, Jakarta, which is in the Ciptutat area that is part of the Tangerang City of Banten Province. UIN Sahid is an Islamic campus that has a long history and has alumni that have become prominent Muslim intellectuals and figures. Various intellectual thoughts and Islamic studies at UIN Sahid have influenced Islamic reform in Indonesia, even in the Muslim world. The campus was originally a Religious Affairs Department Academy in 1957 in Jakarta, and was only established as an IAIN in 1960.

During the leadership of the Rector Prof. Dr. Harun Nasution (1973-1984), IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta was known as the Campus of Reform because he made a lot of reforms on Islamic thought, although it tended to be controversial, such as the inclusion of philosophy courses in the curriculum and sending IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta lecturers to study in Western countries. During this period IAIN Jakarta also held the first Postgraduate Program in Indonesia. This development began to be intensified during the leadership of Prof. Dr. Azyumardi Azra, MA. in 1988 with the concept of IAIN with wider mandate which became the foundation of the formation of the State Islamic University of UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta in 2002.

In order to develop its institution, UIN Sahid Jakarta Jakarta has set its vision "to become a world-class university with the integration of scientific, Islamic and Indonesia-related studies." This goal seems to continue to be realized by the academic community at UIN Sahid Jakarta. Integrating science, Islam and Indonesian-ness is a key word that continues to be pursued, as well as being committed to preparing students to become citizens and members of the community with

competitive academic, professional and or vocational abilities and can develop Islamic religious studies, science and technology , and arts to improve people's lives and enrich national culture.

Third, the Ar-Raniri State Islamic University (UIN) is one of the Islamic higher education institutions located in Banda Aceh, Nangroe Aceh Darussalam Province, a province that has a very strong Islamic history, and is the only province in Indonesia that gets privaledge to impose a limited Islamic law. The history and socio-religious conditions in the country which is commonly referred to as the "Veranda of Mecca" also brought new changes to the scientific and religious developments in Aceh. UIN Ar-Rani was originally a Branch of IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, and then stood alone as the Ar-Raniry IAIN Banda Aceh in 1963. In 2013, when IAIN A-Raniri celevrated its 50th anniversary, this largest Islamic College in Aceh changed its face and name from Institutut to Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh State Islamic University. After becoming a university, UIN Ar-Raniri began to open various faculties and fields of science and technology studies, such as the Faculty of engineering, the Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, and the Faculty of Psychology. Today, UIN Ar-Rani has become one of the leading universities in Aceh Province.

As a large and influential Islamic higher education in Banda Aceh, UIN Ar-Raniri has established its institutional vision "As a Center for Contemporary and International-Level Islamic Studies." In this context, Ar-Raniri seeks to be a superior university in the development and integration of Islamic studies, science, technology and arts. "Similar to UIN Sahid Jakarta, integration is the key word in scientific development at this University, and is expected to inspire the entire academic process and scientific atmosphere that develops there. Based on the Academic Guidelines of UIN Ar-Raniry in the Academic Year of 2017/2018, the scientific paradigm of UIN Ar-Raniry is "Fricatization of Science", which is ontologically, epistemologically, and axiologically related to scientific integration. However, the process of integration or fricatification of science is still continuing to look for forms. Fricatification of more sciences is displayed through introduction of the sciences and technology sciences.

3.3. Academic Atmosphere and the Idea of Multiculturalism Based on Information and Communication Technology

In the context of multicultural religious life in Indonesia. The role of the state Islamic higher education community is to build moderate diversity as part of the awareness of multiculturalism. It broadens the study of multiculturalism in Islamic higher education institutions. This section will show how the three Islamic religious colleges of the country develop a spirit of multiculturalism with various dynamics in the development of information and communication technology.

First, multiculturalism is institutionalized in the form of the university's vision and mission (Modood, 2010: 157-170). This was, for example, done at IAIN Ambon. The multiculturalism discourse that develops in Ambon, is a conception developed based on a collective awareness of the social reality of the multicultural Moluccan people. Moreover, religious conflict in the Moluccas during 1999-2004, has provided valuable lessons on the need to find models of religious development that are in line with the conditions of society. The idea of the need for a spirit of multiculturalism in the development of academic systems at IAIN Ambon, began around 2012. In various peace seminars held at IAIN Ambon, multiculturalism has been discussed in depth. In 2013 a meeting was held to strengthen the vision and mission of IAIN Ambon, which was realized by various parties in Maluku who then formulated their vision as, "To become professional in integrating Islam, science, culture and technology into multicultural relations in 2032." Involving many experts to formulate and complete the concept.

The idea of multiculturalism was then realized with a textbook on "Introduction to Multiculturalism," written by a number of IAIN Ambon lecturers. At the end of 2017, IAIN Ambon invited Prof. Amin Abdullah, an Islamic studies expert of UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta to discuss and comment on the draft of the book before being printed as an official document and taught in all classes at IAIN Ambon.

In general, the multicultural transformation at IAIN Ambon can be seen in several ways. First, curriculum transformation as explained above, both formally and informally. The spirit of multiculturalism is considered to frame all scientific study programs at the Institute. Second, the spirit of multiculturalism is also understood as a new, more progressive view of the relationship

between faiths. For example since since 2015 non-Muslim guest lecturers began to teach at IAIN Ambon: Prof. Max Tukang and Prof. Alohiab Watloly of Pattimura University Ambon, Dr. Lies Marantika of the Moluccan Indonesia Christian University of (UKIM), and Dr. Yance Zadrak Rumahuru of the Ambon State Christian Religious Studies Institute (IAKN). The lecturers at IAIN Ambon were also given permission to help teach at the Ambon State Christian Religious Studies Institute. At the same time, in 2017 IAIN Ambon began to admit non-Muslim students. Six students from the TVRI Molucca office were accepted as students in the Department of Islamic Journalism at the Faculty of Usuluddin and Da'wah. Third, multiculturalism also changes the perspective of the IAIN Ambon academic community on the differences in religious understanding which are well accommodated at the Institute. For example, differences in schools od thought, differences in religious thought, social organizations to political views. This can be seen in the debate held by a group of lecturers when there were rumors about prohibition of wearing *niqab* at IAIN Ambon, which was personified as the uniform of several radical groups in Indonesia. Many lecturers regretted that the IAIN Ambon had to forbid female students from wearing *niqab* as practiced by UIN Sunan Kalijaga in Yogyakarta. This contradicts the basic principles of multiculturalism that respects differences, including differences in dress choices for a Muslim, unless there is a connection between *niqab* and radicalism and violence at IAIN Ambon.

One of the research centers at IAIN Ambon which is the center of multiculturalism studies is Ambon Reconciliation and Mediation Center (ARMC), an institution that is concerned with the development of multiculturalism at IAIN Ambon. Various seminars, discussions and FGDs have been conducted to promote Islamic values and multiculturalism. ARMC are building partnerships with reputable national and international institutions such as Indonesian Netherland Moslem and Christian Relations (INMCR). ARMC also cooperates with the Center for Islamic and Community Studies (PPIM) of UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, to organize the Interfaith Youth Camp and to work with the Habibi Center to prevent radicalism.

Second, internalizing the values of multiculturalism in the academic atmosphere even though it does not literally put forward the formal concept of multiculturalism (Portera, 2010: 26-44). This can be seen in the phenomenon of UIN Sahid Jakarta. At UIN Sahid Jakarta, multiculturalism is not institutionalized as the institutional vision, but prevails in Islamic thought and studies developed at the campus. For example, this can be read in the book "Islamic Deconstruction of the Ciputat School of Thought" written by a number of Islamic intellectuals from UIN Sahid such as Nurcholish Madjid, Azyumardi Azra, Komaruddin Hidayat, Fachry Ali, etc. The publication of the book "*Islam Mazhab Ciputat*" as an important publication about how Islamic intellectuals from UIN Sahid Jakarta view the need for reform of multicultural, social and religious life in Indonesia. Abudin Nata in his article "Islam of the Ciputat School of Thought which is recognized at the National and International Level" stated that the Islam of Ciputat School of Thought is a combination of normative, theological, sociological, historical and moral-spiritual aspects of Islam which gave birth to a unique Islamic view of the UIN Ciputat community. Harun Nasution was the main character behind what was later referred to as the Islamic School of Thought of Ciputat. While Nurcholish Madjid and Azumardi Azra were the first generation of IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah who adopted Harun Nasution's ideas and introduced the ideas of Islamic modernism with all its variants.

Azyumardi Azra is one of the main intellectuals at UIN Sahid who has written and produced works on multiculturalism. He writes books, scientific articles, or opinions in various media to promote multiculturalism as a conceptual solution in managing diversity in Indonesia. In an introduction to the book *Religious Education with Multicultural Insights* by Zakiyuddin Baidawi (Lecturer of UIN Sahid), Azyumardi Azra wrote that multiculturalism is an imperative of civilization, because multiculturalism believes that every culture has significance and values so that it gets a place and respect as other cultures.

Another important thing is how to develop multiculturalism to develop in the broad academic life at UIN Ciputat. Multiculturalism at UIN Sahid Ciputat is not explicitly approved in the institutional vision and mission. However, the long experience of Islamic studies from Islamic intellectuals graduating from UIN Sahid Ciputat, the spirit of multiculturalism has been internalized and adopted in academic practice. For example, in a postgraduate course one subject is

approved by lecturers from various scientific backgrounds, and developed. All of that shows the power of multicultural demonstrations at UIN Sahid. It also attracted many non-Muslim students to continue their studies at UIN Sahid Jakarta. The number of non-Muslim students at IAIN Jakarta is currently estimated at around 50 people, many of whom are from abroad. UIN Jakarta allows all groups, including non-Muslims, to study at the UIN Jakarta campus. At present at UIN Sahid Jakarta, non-Muslim students are not only Christians, but also Buddhists and Confucians. UIN Sahid Jakarta also often invites guest lecturers from various countries, from various scientific and religious backgrounds. They all must provide new insights about scientific developments on campus.

The development of Islamic thought and multiculturalism has also occurred in a number of study centers at UIN Sahid Jakarta. The Center for Islamic and Community Studies (PPIM) is one of the institutions at UIN Jakarta which has a concern on the development of a democratic society. PPIM published numeous research and study results about Islam and local values, multiculturalism, reactualization and transformation of religion into social, political and economic life, coupled with the strengthening of democracy, gender, human rights, and ideas about Islam and civil society, illustrating the discourse of Islam that has developed as a dynamic. In addition, there is also a study center called the Center for the Study of Religion and Culture (CSRC) of UIN Jakarta. The CSRC builds an Islamic perspective that is rooted in Islamic traditions, modernity, and Indonesian-ness and positively actualizes the teachings, values and ethics of Islam in the life of the Muslim community, so that they can increase their role in socio-cultural life constructively. One of the focus programs at the CSRC is dialogue between cultures, religions (pluralism) and democracy.

Third, the development of multicuralism discourse (Tremblay, 2019: 15-53) at UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh has not been running well. The Islamic environment which is dominated by the needs of the implementation of Islamic Sharia in some social aspect, have changed the Islamic discourse at UIN Ar-Raniri in recent years. There are not enough books or scientific publications that describe the tendency of the academic community to promote multiculturalism as the main idea in Ar-Raniri. Masterpiece works by UIN Ar-Raniri lecturers specialized in Acehnologi, Islamic Geography, Thought Reconstruction, Sovereign Customary, etc., have not fully described multiculturalism in the Province. Even so there are some works that discuss and allude to Aceh in the context of multiculturalism, especially about multicultural education. Mumtazul Fikri, one of the lecturers who wrote about multicultural education, said that the condition of Aceh with a strong Islamic influence created a kind of religious hegemony. So that studies of interfaith dialog are lacking. Interfaith tolerance and interfaith relations issues have not been considered urgent themes to be discussed, or become academic studies which are developed in academic discourse. That is why we lack the studies on multiculturalism, or works that allude to the development of Aceh in the context of multicultural society.

However, several important events concerning tolerance, majority and minority relations in the midst of the enactment of Islamic law in Aceh, have become the subject of discussion among UIN Ar-Rani lecturers, especially when the Setara Institute released survey data in 2018 which stated that Banda Aceh was among the three most "intolerant" cities in Indonesia, where Banda Aceh was ranked second lowest. The findings led to widespread protests, especially from the group of scholars including some lecturers from UIN Ar-Raniri. Yusran, an Acehnese cleric who is also the Chairperson of the Indonesian Intellectuals and Young Ulema Council (MIUMI) who is also the Chairperson of the Aceh Da'wah Council and a Member of the Association of Ulama and Da'i Southeast Asia, said he rejected the findings of the Setara Institute.

This survey is not supported by valid data and facts. This is clearly a public deception. This is tantamount to accusing Islamic law which has been enacted in Aceh, which has created intolerant life in Aceh, especially in Banda Aceh as the capital of Aceh province. Of course this survey has hurt the hearts of Muslims in Aceh, especially in Banda Aceh.

However, the findings of the Setara Institute began to encourage some lecturers at UIN Ar-Raniri to discuss whether the application of Islamic law has caused certain resistance to minorities. As reflected in the works of Mumatazul Fikri in his paper on "Persuasive Islam and Multiculturalism in Aceh: Efforts to Reconstruct the Implementation of Islamic Sharia-based Education." Mumtazul who began to pursue multiculturalism issues and conducted research on

minority groups in Aceh also published another article entitled "Islamic Sharia and Educational Discrimination against Non-Muslims in Aceh." In his paper Mumtazul Fikri encouraged the need for persuasion in carrying out Islamic law and paying attention to minority rights in the context of the implementation of Islamic law in Aceh. Mumtazul Fikri wrote: "…sharp criticism of the implementation of Islamic law in Aceh, that government policies must guarantee diversity in people's identities, and legal regulations must be able to protect all elements of society. And policies with one-sided interpretations will actually push away the achievement of these policies. So should the question arises, why hasn't the Islamic Sharia in Aceh found the right momentum in changing the character of the Acehnese people to accept Islam as their way of life? The mistake does not lie in Islam and the concept of Sharia it contains. However, the approach to the application of Islamic law has not been able to touch the hearts of the people of Aceh. So in this context, Aceh needs a persuasive conception of Islam that is able to learn by heart and embrace the diversity of cultures in society."

For UIN Ar-Raniri academics such as Mumatazul Fikri, there needs to be a more intensive study of Islam and multiculturalism to re-establish Islamic law in Aceh in the increasingly modern life of Acehnese society. Otherwise, Islamic law will be a mere political instrument of law, and does not have a more tangible impact on Islamic civilization. It has also received the attention of many parties that the development of Islamic law needs to address the existence of human rights which have become universal values.

3.4. Observing Multiculturalism Development in State Islamic Higher Education

The development of the discourse on multiculturalism and how the institutionalization process in the three Islamic higher education institutions raised in this study shows several facts about how the issues of citizenship have been understood, discussed and developed in different contexts. The internal dynamics of Islamic higher education, the social context of society and other interests have altered the discourse. This section will discuss these dynamics by using the framework of Piere Bourdeu's social reproduction theory and in certain contexts Anthony Giddens about agencies to uncover actors, narratives and interests related to multiculturalism discourse in Islamic higher education institutions. In other words, this section will show how multiculturalism is understood by actors in higher education institutions, campaigned or socialized as academic narratives and subsequently used for various purposes (Sieweke, 2014:22-42; Ripero-Muñiz, 2020: 65-92).

3.4.1. Multiculturalism Narrative Discourse in Islamic Higher Education

The narratives of multiculturalism in Islamic higher education institutions are a new idea that grows along with awareness of the plurality of Indonesians from Sabang to Merauke. This awareness demands diverse academic reflection from the Islamic higher education community. Of the three higher education institutions, it can be seen how the discourse of multiculturalism is understood.

First, multiculturalism is understood as a Western idea, so it needs to be carefully adapted (Dauvergne, 2019: 1-16). The history of multicultural concepts produced in the context of traumatic tensions in the West, for some does not reflect Indonesia's sociological conditions. This suggests that some conservatives in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia view multiculturalism as a product of Western thought that must be handled carefully, especially in an Islamic society that has merged all aspects of differences in Islamic brotherhood (Keller, 2020: 180-196). Multiculturalism is considered a Western ideology which can disintegrate the unity of the people over dangerous primordial diversity. This view makes many high-level Islamic groups, such as in UIN Ar-RANIRI, who are quite careful in making multiculturalism a solution in the development of Islamic society, especially in Aceh where the community is quite homogeneous, the idea of multiculturalism would, for some people, weaken the cohesiveness of the community that has been built in the construction of Islamic law.

Second, multiculturalism has been understood as an idea that is relevant to Islam (Alizadeh, 2019). Since the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) issued a fatwa forbidding Western ideas, such as secularism, pluralism and liberalism which are considered to destroy the religious understanding of Indonesian Muslims, the study of Islam and multiculturalism or Islamic multiculturalism

education has become a trending topic in research conducted by lecturers (Thio, 2019: 1007-1034). at Islamic higher education. For example the study by Azyumardi Azra and intellectuals of UIN Sahid Jakarta generally stated that multiculturalism was in line with the history of Islam, as elegantly practiced by Prophet Muhammad and his Companions in the period of Medina. Even at that time a fundamental treaty emerged which came to be called the "Medina Charter" which regulates diversity in the small country of Medina. In an article Azra wrote: "Historically, multicultural life is not something new for Muslims. Since the early days of Islam and more specifically in the post Rashidun Caliphate period, the rapid growth of Muslims in various regions of the world was at the same time involved accommodation and conflict with local realities which, thanks to the presence of Islam and Muslims, were also increasingly multicultural. This reality is increasingly apparent when political power that crosses various cultural regions is in the hands of Muslims since the Umaiyah Dynasty, the Abbasids in Baghdad and Andalusia, the Ottomans, Moghul, and so on to Southeast Asia". The same was stated by other Islamic higher education intellectuals, such as Nur Syam of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya. In his works, *the Challenge of Multiculturalism in Indonesia, from Radicalism toward Nationalism* (2009), Nur Syam said that Islam views diversity as a necessity (sunnatullah) that applies to everything related to the world and everything in it. Then the difference, diversity, heteregonity, and whatever the name and shape is a reality that is inevitable. Efforts to force uniformity are contrary to the basic character of Islam (Nugraha, 2019: 98-112).

Studies on multiculturalism in Islam brought many academics at Islamic higher education to the conclusion that multicultural discourse is not a new discourse in Islam, where Islam itself is built on diversity.

Third, multiculturalism is understood as an idea that is needed in Indonesia. Idonesia is a large country that has been destined as a pluralistic society, both in terms of religion, ethnicity and culture. This country occupies a vast geographical area, consisting of 17,000 large and small islands that stretch between two continents namely Australia and Asia and two giant oceans namely the Indian Ocean and the Pacific Ocean. So it is not surprising if Indonesia has long been a melting pot for various races, religions, political ideologies, and various other interests.

Based on historical facts and the multitude of anthropological and sociological facts on Indonesia, many Islamic intellectuals at Islamic higher education later saw the need for Islamic studies on diversity. Experts such as Azyumardi Azra, Nur Syam, Mashuri and several others then offered the idea of Multiculturalism in strengthening the Pancasila national political ideology to overshadow various forms of diversity in Indonesia, although the concept of multiculturalism is seen as a new discourse, especially in Indonesia, when compared to the issue of pluralism whose various theories have developed relatively well established. Its proponents see multiculturalism as important to continue to be pushed into public awareness, considering that Indonesia is a country whose people are very multicultural, especially in terms of ethnicity and religion. A configuration that must be maintained so that it can be a positive potential for national development, not the other way around which is the potential for conflict (Ashley, and Barnes, 2019: 169-197). This is the concern of Islamic higher education like IAIN Ambon, which has developed multiculturalism as its vision and mission, because academics there have experienced firsthand, how diversity was not managed wisely, resulting in social conflict in the Moluccas for several years.

3.4.2. Actors' involvement in the Multiculturalism Campaign

The idea of multicularism that is growing in Islamic higher education institutions is also very much determined by the intellectual struggle of the leaders of the institutions and senior lecturers who have considerable influence in the local higher education institutions (Wekke and Mokodenseho, 2017). Higher education leaders who have a broad understanding of the concepts of diversity generally have a tendency to mainstream multiculturalism themes in the academic discourse on their campuses.

We can find this evidence at the IAIN Ambon's case where the leadership of the institution supports the mainstreaming of the idea of multiculturalism. This phenomenon did not take place suddenly because, a figure like the Rector, Dr. Hasbolah Toisuta, has a fairly good intellectual reputation and has long been engaged in issues of diversity, peace, conflict and civics. Hasbollah

Toisuta also holds a Doctoral degree from UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta in the field of Islamic Studies. Many of his works are related to issues of conflict and peace in the Moluccas. One of his famous books is "The Collapse of Our Baeleo" which recounts the impact of the conflict on local wisdom and brotherhood in the Moluccas. Rector Hasbollah himself was one of the exponents of the 2002 Malino Agreement, an agreement between Muslim and Christian leaders who ended the religious conflict that occurred in the Moluccas during 1999-2002 (Kadir, 2019: 344-359).

Rector Hasbollah was supported by a number of lecturers such as Mohdar Yanlua, Ismail DP, Abdullah Latuapo, as well as progressive young lecturers at IAIN Ambon such as Abidin Wakano, Abubakar Kabakoran, Abdul Manaf Tubaka, Saidin Ernas, etc., who had been engaged in discourses on diversity and peace-building in the Moluccas. Like Hasbollah, lecturers who write and study a lot about multiculturalism come from educational backgrounds in social science and Islamic studies with a strong tradition of research on diversity issues. Since he became Rector of IAIN Ambon in 2013, Hasbollah invited experts such as Robert Hefner, Azyumardi Azra, Amin Abdullah, Fuad Jabali and several others to discuss the idea of multiculturalism at IAIN Ambon. The intellectual discourse encouraged the idea to make a multicultural theme at IAIN Ambon mission and vision.

The same thing can also be found in the development of intellectualism at IAIN Sahid Jakarta. The idea and Islamic thoughts of the Ciputat School which was explored, formulated and developed by various intellectual figures in Ciputat, can be channeled through various ways, because it is supported by university leaders in the reformist and progressive UIN Sahid. The 6th Rector of UIN Sahid (1973-1984) Harun Nasution, was a a *par execelence* graduate of Western education. He was a promonent academic, intellectual, thinker, philosopher and Muslim figure. In his position as an actor and lecturer, Harun Nasution carried out reform n the curricula at IAIN Sahid and made various changes in academic culture gradually. After his era, Nasution succeeded in passing the reins of leadership to a number of highly progressive second generation intellectuals such as Azyumardi Azra (Rector of two terms, 1998-2002/2002-2006) who personally paid attention to the development of Islamic ideas and multiculturalism.

Azyumardi Azra's educational background from the prestigious Columbia University campus in the United States has gave him the capacity to develop Islamic thought and Islamic social history in Indonesia. In the Azyumardi Azra era many study centers were established which were at the forefront of the dissemination of ideas in an external context. Various international and national conference activities were held to discuss the issues of multiculturalism, minority protection, conflict and peace. The same thing was carried out by the Rector Komarudin Hidayat who is also a progressive Islamic thinker in Indonesia who developed a lot of philosophical thinking from the Turkish Angkara University. Komarudin continued Azyumardi Azra's thoughts in various university policies, while Azyurmardi himself continued to disseminate his knowledge in various works.

Although UIN Sahid Jakarta does not explicitly include the issue of multiculturalism in its vision and mission in the form of various academic practices, it requires internalization of multiculturalism itself. Such as the acceptance of non-Muslim students in significant numbers, egalitarian patterns of education and teaching, to respect the various schools and thinking that developed at UIN Sahid.

As for the case of UIN Ar-RAniri Banda Aceh, it can be seen that the development of studies on multiculturalism and its desemination is still not running well. Aside from the fact that this issue is not considered contextual with the socio-cultural Acehnese society that is homogeneous in religion and ethnic identity, it is also because the intellectual actors who are leaders at UIN Ar-Raniri are not academics who have a strong background in the fields of Islamic studies, philosophy and civics studies. So various campus policies do not open space for studies that intersect with multiculturalism and its dissemination to the public. This can be observed in the lack of studies on multiculturalism conducted here (Robbins, Robbins and Frailey, 2019: 107-121). Some lecturers who pursue issues on pluralism, multiculturalism and politics are still limited. They are not key actors who have influence in the UIN Ar-Raniri environment. Even in the case of bullying of Dr. Rosnida Sari, who was considered to have misled UIN Ar-Raniri students for taking them to study in a church in Banda Aceh, could not be seen in the defense of the progressive lecturer.

It can be widely seen that the actors involved in the institutionalization of education in Islamic higher education institutions such as in the case of IAIN Ambon and UIN Sahid Jakarta, have the same profile. They pursue the study of philosophy and social science which is the basis of multiculturalism that has developed so far. The context of habitus plays an important role here. Refers to habitus, a cognitive structure through which actors digest reality. Actors use habitus to relate to social reality because it has been equipped with a series of internal schemes that they use to understand, understand, appreciate, and evaluate the social world. This scheme is related in such a way as to form a cognitive structure that provides a framework for individual actions with others in their daily lives. Educational background, career, intellectual social space, works, etc., form a scientific habitus that determines how the actors at Islamic higher education promote or adopt certain views (Asfiati and Wekke, 2019: 2604-2608). These views eventually become the atmosphere and form the mainstream. Thinking about multiculturalism or about diversity becomes awareness that is disseminated in various forms of activities (Abaszadeh, Moinzadeh and Eslami-Rasekh, 2019: 52-68). That is why Bourdieu sees habitus as a key to social reproduction because it is central in promoting and regulating the practices that shape academic life at IAIN Ambon and UIN Jakarta. Whereas in the case of UIN Ar-Raniri, such habitus has yet to be established so that it is unable to form a scientific atmosphere of multiculturalism that develops on the campus (Lin, 2020: 25-51).

3.5. Comparative Analysis of Institutionalized Model of Ideas of Multiculturalism in the Age of Information and Communication Technology

Analysis of the multiculturalism discourse that is developed as well as the actors and various institutional interests that stand behind the promotion of the idea of multiculturalism, shows that the choice of discourse and social context in the era of the development of information and communication technology largely determines the acceptance or rejection of multiculturalism ideas that continue to reproduce in academic spaces in each Islamic higher education institutions which is the subject of this study. These differences are called the institutionalization model of the idea of multiculturalism in Indonesia. This study demonstares three models, the IAIN Ambon model, the UIN Sahid Jakarta model and the UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh model.

First, Ambon's IAIN model is a situation where multiculturalism is symbolically expressed, explicitly and clearly stated in the university's vision. IAIN Ambon's vision which states "Being professional in integrating Islam, science, culture and technology in a multicultural framework by 2032," is a symbolic statement that continues to be fought for in various aspects. Although until now, multiculturalism has not been translated more broadly in all intellectual activities on campus, multiculturalism can be called a symbol of scholarship and academic behavior. In the future for the acceptance of interfaith students, acceptance of interfaith lecturers will be a challenge for the institutionalization of multiculturalism, as part of developing the vision and mission of the Ambon IAIN as a multicultural campus in Indonesia. Ambon's IAIN must continue to show commitment to multiculturalism, not only academic discourse, or included as a curriculum in the review process, but also developed as an important part of institutional policy and disseminated to the wider community. The multiculturalism development model in IAIN Ambon must shift from the isolationist multiculturalism model. This model illustrates the existence of a plural society whose cultural groups primarily seek to build equality, but still maintain a dominant culture in the community. So the idea of internalizing the idea of multiculturalism in IAIN Ambon needs to be reformulated either in the normative provisions of the campus, or other provisions that give freedom to all groups to maintain or develop their culture and existence. Likewise, groups that may be minorities are not abandoned, but accommodated.

Second, the UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta model in which multiculturalism is internalized in academic culture. The reproduction of the idea of multiculturalism at UIN Sahid Jakarta is not adapted symbolically, for example in the statement of vision and mission, as developed in IAIN Ambon. But the actors at the campus are able to internalize the spirit and values of multiculturalism in academic life and policy dissemination. The UIN Jakarta Academic Community is capable of reintegrating science at the level of ontology, epistemology and axiology so that there is no longer any dichotomy between general and religious sciences. Likewise, it articulates the teachings of

Islam that is *rahmatan lil Al-lamin* (blessings for all creations). UIN Jakarta has a very large community of students and lecturers from various religious communities.

Multiculturalism developed at UIN Jakarta is exactly what Azyumardi Azra --rector and main leader of UIN Sahid Jakarta for almost a decade-- initiated, namely cosmopolitan multiculturalism. Such understanding of multiculturalism has been successfully translated as a way to build a plural community that seeks to eradicate cultural boundaries altogether to create a society where each individual is no longer bound to a particular culture, instead freely engaging in intercultural experiments and at the same time developing each other's cultural life. As a large Islamic campus located in the capital city Jakarta, UIN Sahid Jakarta seeks to position itself as a modern Islamic campus. They develop inclusive ideas that reflect a deep understanding of diversity that has been referred to as sunnatullah. So at UIN Sahid Jakarta, controversial ideas often emerge, such as the idea of Islamic secularization in the style of Nurkholis Madjid.

Third, the UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh model, where the ideas of multiculturalism do not seem to develop, either in the form of discourse or policy practices. The works on multiculturalism, the results of research and books at the Islamic Campus located in the Sharia Province show that multiculturalism is not a mainstream issue in academic discourse there. The idea of multiculturalism is actually accepted by the academic community, but academic actors at Ar-Raniri, such as the rector and lecturers, do not consider multiculturalism as an academic idea that needs discourse space in Aceh. Moreover, the Province of Aceh is considered a country that implements Islamic law so that there is religious homogeneity. Islam is the dominant narrative in Aceh and as such, minority communities must respect Aceh's profile as the dominant Muslim region by implementing Islamic law in Indonesia.

In a number of interviews, the actors on the Ar-Raniri campus several times mentioned that multiculturalism was not the focus of study, because what was very urgent at the moment was how to strengthen the idea of Aceh as a sharia state. UIN Ar-Raniri as the largest Islamic campus in Aceh must contribute to the strengthening of Islamic law. The Sharia Faculty of UIN Ar-Raniri has become a "kitchen" that helps formulate various concepts of the development of Islamic law which will be disseminated to the public (government and society). Research on Islamic law, Islamic education, Islamic history seems to be the dominant narrative. The UIN Ar-Raniri phenomenon shows that in the context of the institutionalization of multiculturalism on campus, it is still trapped in what is called isolationist multiculturalism. Isolationist multiculturalism is the opportunity of various cultural groups in society to carry out their lives independently and not be too involved in interaction (Wardi, Ismail, Zainollah, and Wekke, 2019). In the literature on multiculturalism, it is often exemplified as a society that exists in a "millet" system in the Turkish or Amish Ottoman community in the United States. This group accepts diversity, but at the same time tries to maintain their culture separately from other communities.

4. Conclusion

This study shows that multiculturalism in the development of information and communication technology has been institutionalized in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia, despite the different contexts. Thus there are two important things concluded to answer the problems in this study.

First, multiculturalism has become a serious academic and intellectual conversation in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia, as reflected by IAIN Ambon and UIN Sahid Jakarta. Multiculturalism is understood as a discourse that is in line with and relevant to the spirit of Islam in viewing diversity. In multiculturalism, there are key values such as respect for differences, human equality, and tolerance which are not only relevant to Islam but become basic values in Islamic teachings. Although this idea came from the West, it is considered one of the important concepts in building a harmonious and peaceful social life in Indonesia. Therefore, in the last few years, multiculturalism has become a serious themes and object of research in study centers, and even adopted as the vision and mission of Islamic higher education institutions .

Second, the institutionalization of the idea of multiculturalism in the system and academic life in Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia can be seen in three models. The ordinary acceptance model because multiculturalism is not considered an important idea that is needed by

the academic community at Islamic campuses, as in the case at UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh. While the symbolic acceptance model in which multiculturalism is adapted as applied in IAIN Ambon, which has openly adapted multiculturalism in the vision and mission of the institution. However, this symbolic model has weaknesses, because if actors and the local academic community cannot internalize the values of multiculturalism in the academic life, it will tend to get stuck on what experts call isolationist multiculturalism, as can be observed at UIN Ar-Raniri Banda Aceh. The substantive model adopted by the academic community at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta has the opportunity to internalize the idea of multiculturalism more strongly and deeply. In this substantive model, multiculturalism is explicitly not institutionalized, but rather its values live and are practiced in academic activities and the overall atmosphere of the university. Certainly it would be better if the symbolic IAIN Ambon model could be combined with the substantive model of UIN Sahid Jakarta.

This phenomenon shows that the strengthening of multiculturalism must continue to be bult in Islamic higher education from being merely symbolic to being substantive. Multicultural-based Islamic education in Islamic higher education institutions will strengthen the highest respect for human dignity from wherever they come and whatever their culture. It is hoped that Islam higher education institutions can contribute to the development of an inclusive, moderate and democratic academic society. Thus Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia, currently 58 in total, are expected to contribute to the development of an egalitarian society as Islam itself promotes the spirit of peace.

References

[1]   Abaszadeh, Samira, Ahmad Moinzadeh, and Abbas Eslami-Rasekh, "Translator Education in the Light of Complexity Theory: A Case of Iran's Higher Education System", *International Journal of Society, Culture & Language* 7.2 (Special Issue on Iranians Views of Cultural Issues) (2019), pp. 52-68.

[2]   Abdullah, M. Amin, "The Intersubjective Type of Religiosity: A Contribution (a fresh Ijtihad) of Indonesian Islamic Studies to a Multicultural Society", *AICIS XV Manado*., (2014), pp. 21-24.

[3]   Alfita, L., A. L. Kadiyono, P. T. Nguyen, W. Firdaus, and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Educating the External Conditions in the Educational and Cultural Environment", *International Journal of Higher Education*., vol. 8, no. 8, (2019).

[4]   Alizadeh, Masoud, "Reconciliation between the Islamic Human Rights and International Law: Prospects and Complications", *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*., vol. 6, no. 4, (2019).

[5]   An'Amta, D. A. A., and S. Mattiro, "Development of democracy in multiculturalism through open spaces in Indonesia" In *1st International Conference on Social Sciences Education-" Multicultural Transformation in Education, Social Sciences and Wetland Environment"(ICSSE 2017)*, Atlantis Press, (2017).

[6]   Andriansyah, A., T. Taufiqurokhman and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Responsiveness of public policy and its impact on education management: An empirical assessment from Indonesia", *Management Science Letters*., vol. 9, no. 3, (2019), pp. 413-424.

[7]   Asfiati, A., and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Lecturers' participation in applying blended learning in Islamic higher education in Indonesia", *Universal Journal of Educational Research*., vol. 7, no. 12, (2019), pp. 2604-2608.

[8]   Ashley, Caroline, and Jonathan Barnes, "Wildlife use for economic gain: The potential for wildlife to contribute to development in Namibia", *Environmental Sustainability*., CRC Press, (2019), pp. 169-197.

[9]   Azra, Azyumardi, "Kegalauan Identitas dan Kekerasan Sosial: Multikulturalisme, Demokrasi dan Pancasila", *EMPATI: Jurnal Ilmu Kesejahteraan Sosial*., vol. 1, no. 1, (2012), pp. 1-12.

[10]   Dauvergne, Catherine, "Gendering Islamophobia to better understand immigration laws", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studie*., (2019), pp. 1-16.

[11] Gerring, J., M. Hoffman, and D. Zarecki, "The diverse effects of diversity on democracy", *British Journal of Political Science*., vol. 48, no. 2, (2018), pp. 283-314.

[12] Hakim, D. "Inclusivism and exclusivism as well as their effect on islamic education based multicultural", *International Journal of Islamic Education, Research and Multiculturalism (IJIERM)*., vol. 1, no. 2, (2019), pp. 18-29.

[13] Hammarberg, Karin, Maggie Kirkman, and Sheryl de Lacey, "Qualitative research methods: when to use them and how to judge them", *Human reproduction*., vol. 31, no. 3, (2016), pp. 498-501.

[14] Hanurawan, Fattah, and Peter Waterworth, "Multicultura Perpectives in Indonesian Social Studies Education Curriculum", *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*., vol. 4, (2016).

[15] Harjatanaya, T. Y., and C. Y. Hoon, "Politics of multicultural education in Post-Suharto Indonesia: A study of the Chinese minority", *Compare: a journal of comparative and international education*., vol. 50, no. 1, (2020), pp. 18-35.

[16] Hefner, R. W., "Whatever happened to civil Islam? Islam and democratisation in Indonesia, 20 years on", *Asian Studies Review*., vol. 43, no. 3, (2019), pp. 375-396.

[17] Howard, A., P. Dickert, G. Owusu, and D. Riley, "In service of the Western world: Global citizenship education within a Ghanaian elite context", *British Journal of Educational Studies*., vol. 66, no. 4, (2018), pp. 497-514.

[18] Howell, E. A., H. Brown, J. Brumley, S. A. Bryant, A. B. Caughey, A. M. Cornell, and J. M. Mhyre, "Reduction of peripartum racial and ethnic disparities: a conceptual framework and maternal safety consensus bundle", *Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic & Neonatal Nursing*., vol. 47, no. 3, (2018), pp. 275-289.

[19] Hugo, G., "Demography of race and ethnicity in Indonesia", *The International Handbook of the Demography of Race and Ethnicity*, Springer, Dordrecht, (2015), pp. 259-280.

[20] Kadir, Hatib Abdul, "Hierarchical Reciprocities and Tensions between Migrants and Native Moluccas in the Post Reformation", *Journal of Southeast Asian Human Rights*., vol. 3, no. 2, (2019), pp. 344-359.

[21] Keller, Franziska Barbara, "Appropriating Democracy: A Comparison Between Argumentative Strategies for Confucian and Islamic Democracy", *Journal of Intercultural Studies*., vol. 41, no. 2, (2020), pp. 180-196.

[22] Klein, M., "Managing diversity: is Australia bucking the postmulticulturalist trend or on its way to embrace interculturalism?", *Australian & New Zealand Journal of European Studies*., vol. 8, no. 2, (2016).

[23] Krishan, Kewal, and Shilpa Chauhan, "Literacy & Poverty among Minorities in India." *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*., vol. 6, no. 7, (2016), pp. 283-302.

[24] Lin, Mei-ling, "Educational Upward Mobility. Practices of Social Changes--Research on Social Mobility and Educational Inequality", *International Journal of Social Science Studies*., vol. 8, no. 3, (2020), pp. 25-51.

[25] Melikov, I., and O. Skorodumova, "Interaction of cultures: from tolerance to culture of dialogue", *Economic and Social Development: Book of Proceedings*., (2019), pp. 779-784.

[26] Modood, T., "Multicultural citizenship and Muslim identity politics", *Interventions*., vol. 12, no. 2, (2010), pp. 157-170.

[27] Mondal, Anshuman A., "Articles of faith: Freedom of expression and religious freedom in contemporary multiculture", *Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations*., vol. 27, no. 1, (2016), pp. 3-24.

[28] Nugraha, Muhamad Tisna, "Teachings of Violence in Education: Review of War Material on Islamic Cultural History Subjects at the Elementary Level", *Istawa: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*., vol. 4, no. 2, (2019), pp. 98-112.

[29] Portera, Agostino, "Intercultural and multicultural education: Epistemological and semantic aspects", *Intercultural and multicultural education*. Routledge, (2010), pp. 26-44.

[30] Ripero-Muñiz, Nereida, "Agency of Somali Migrant Women in Nairobi and Johannesburg: Negotiating Religious and Cultural Identifications in Diasporic Spaces", *African Studies Review*., vol. 63. no.1, (2020), pp. 65-92.

[31] Robbins, Regina E., Travis R. Robbins, and Mark Frailey, "Campus-Based Ecotourism: A Case Study on the Power of Local Ecotourism", *Great Plains Research.*, vol. 29, no. 2, (2019), pp. 107-121.

[32] Rosenthal, Meagen, "Qualitative research methods: Why, when, and how to conduct interviews and focus groups in pharmacy research", *Currents in pharmacy teaching and learning.*, vol. 8, no. 4, (2016), pp. 509-516.

[33] Safitri, D., and A. Efianingrum, "Managing multicultural classrooms of schools in Indonesia: some considerations", In *2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations (ICoSSCE 2019).*, Atlantis Press, (2020), pp. 173-177.

[34] Samsudin, S., and M. M. Zakaria, "Controversy of the liberal-islamic thought about pluralism of religions in Indonesia", *TAWARIKH.*, vol. 9, no. 1, (2017), pp. 71-80.

[35] Sieweke, Jost., "Imitation and processes of institutionalization—Insights from Bourdieu's theory of practice", *Schmalenbach Business Review.*, vol. 66, no. 1, (2014), pp. 24-42.

[36] Thio, Li-ann, "Irreducible Plurality, Indivisible Unity: Singapore Relational Constitutionalism and Cultivating Harmony Through Constructing a Constitutional Civil Religion", *German Law Journal* 20.7 (2019), pp. 1007-1034.

[37] Tremblay, Arjun, "The Multiculturalism Research Programme: Established and Emerging Concerns", *Diversity in Decline?*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, (2019), pp. 15-53.

[38] Wardi, M., I. Ismail, Z. Zainollah, and Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Entrepreneurship and Financing in Islamic Educational Institution of Darul Ulum Banyuanyar Pamekasan", *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal.*, (2019).

[39] Wekke, Ismail Suardi, "Learning and Service Quality in Islamic Higher Education of Minority Muslim Bali", *In International Conference on Ethics in Governance (ICONEG 2016).*, Atlantis Press, (2016).

[40] Wekke, Ismail Suardi, and Sabil Mokodenseho, "Religious Teaching and Learning in Minority Muslim of Manado Indonesia", *2nd International Conference on Education, Science, and Technology (ICEST 2017).*, Atlantis Press, (2017).

Reproduction of Multiculturalism

4%

SIMILARITY INDEX

PRIMARY SOURCES

1 Simon Fong, Yan Zhuang. "Using Medical History Embedded in Biometrics Medical Card for User Identity Authentication: Privacy Preserving Authentication Model by Features Matching", Journal of Biomedicine and Biotechnology, 2012
Crossref

130 words — 1%

2 www.uinjkt.ac.id
Internet

28 words — < 1%

3 www.tandfonline.com
Internet

27 words — < 1%

4 fst.uinjkt.ac.id
Internet

26 words — < 1%

5 diktis.kemenag.go.id
Internet

25 words — < 1%

6 Ronald A. Lukens-Bull. "Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2013
Crossref

19 words — < 1%

7 "Higher Education Regionalization in Asia Pacific", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2012
Crossref

14 words — < 1%

8 Tatum S. Adiningrum. "Reviewing Plagiarism: An Input for Indonesian Higher Education", Journal of Academic Ethics, 2015
Crossref

14 words — < 1%

9   uad.ac.id
Internet   13 words — < 1%

10   www.pakinsight.com
Internet   11 words — < 1%

11   Minako Sakai, Amelia Fauzia. "Islamic orientations in contemporary Indonesia: Islamism on the rise?", Asian Ethnicity, 2013
Crossref   10 words — < 1%

12   Markku Suksi. "Sub-State Governance through Territorial Autonomy", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2011
Crossref   9 words — < 1%

13   M Qomarul Huda, Naili Ulva Sa'adah. "Measurement model of information technology implementation effectiveness", 2014 International Conference on Cyber and IT Service Management (CITSM), 2014
Crossref   9 words — < 1%

14   media.neliti.com
Internet   9 words — < 1%

15   pubs.sciepub.com
Internet   9 words — < 1%

16   es.scribd.com
Internet   8 words — < 1%

17   www.ditpertais.net
Internet   8 words — < 1%

18   pt.scribd.com
Internet   8 words — < 1%

19   Hasnil Basri Siregar. "Lessons Learned from the Implementation of Islamic Shari'ah Criminal Law in Aceh, Indonesia", Journal of Law and Religion, 2015
Crossref   7 words — < 1%