

SERVICE QUALITY AND CONSUMER PROTECTION LAWS IN THE PARKING INDUSTRY: AN IMPLICATIONS FOR CONSUMER SATISFACTION

Husin Wattimena

husinwattimena@iainambon.ac.id

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ambon, Indonesia

Arizal Hamizar

hamizararizal@iainambon.ac.id

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ambon, Indonesia

Hasan

hasan@iainambon.ac.id

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ambon, Indonesia

H. Rajab

rajabzeth@gmail.com

Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ambon, Indonesia

Abstract

The examination of consumer protection laws in the parking sector in Ambon constitutes the primary focus of this study, emphasizing the breaches in service quality that result in customer discontentment and unfavorable perceptions of service provision. Employing the SERVQUAL framework, the study delves into the identification of the five pivotal dimensions of service quality pivotal to customers, encompassing tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. Employing a qualitative research methodology, the investigation scrutinizes both customer and parking attendant experiences, endeavoring to discern the underlying factors contributing to service quality transgressions within the industry. The research findings underscore the pressing necessity for enhanced implementation and enforcement of consumer protection regulations, alongside the establishment of efficient complaint resolution mechanisms to address customer grievances. Furthermore, the study elucidates various factors contributing to service quality violations, including deficient training protocols, absence of licensing requirements, and ineffective regulatory frameworks. It advocates for proactive measures by policymakers and employers to rectify these issues, emphasizing the imperative of adequately training, equipping, and licensing parking attendants to ensure the delivery of exemplary service standards to customers.

Keywords: Consumer Protection Laws, Consumer Satisfaction, Service Quality.

INTRODUCTION



Parking attendants fulfill a significant role in managing the utilization of parking spaces within urban and street settings. While their duties are pivotal for upholding order and averting chaos on roadways, they are also susceptible to mistreatment and exploitation from dissatisfied consumers dissatisfied with their services [13]. Consequently, it becomes imperative to ensure that parking attendants adhere to consumer protection laws aimed at safeguarding consumer rights and interests.

The parking sector constitutes an integral component of any locality's transportation infrastructure [12]. For instance, in Ambon, Indonesia, parking attendants bear the responsibility of facilitating safe vehicle parking and cultivating positive customer experiences. Nonetheless, parking attendants in Ambon frequently encounter obstacles and hardships in their line of work, including instances of unjust treatment or physical aggression from disgruntled consumers. Regrettably, there have also been documented cases wherein parking attendants themselves have been found to contravene consumer protection regulations.

Illustratively, reports have surfaced regarding certain parking attendants in Ambon overcharging customers, exploiting the customers' potential lack of awareness regarding prevailing parking rates. Such actions constitute violations of consumer protection laws, which mandate businesses to levy fair and equitable charges for rendered services. Additionally, instances have emerged wherein parking attendants have issued fines to customers without valid justification or rationale. This conduct can be construed as fraudulent or deceptive, as customers are billed for offenses they did not commit, thereby infringing upon their entitlement to equitable and truthful treatment.

These malpractices not only adversely impact the affected consumers but also undermine the credibility and legitimacy of the parking attendant profession at large. Consequently, enhancing consumer protection measures becomes imperative to ensure that parking attendants are held accountable for their conduct, thus precluding consumers from enduring unjust treatment or rights infringements. The reported instances of parking attendants flouting consumer protection statutes underscore the exigency for more robust regulation and enforcement of consumer protection provisions in Indonesia. By redressing these concerns, policymakers and regulators can foster a fairer and more equitable milieu for both parking attendants and patrons, thereby instilling trust and confidence in the parking attendant vocation and ultimately benefiting the broader populace.

In Indonesia, consumer protection laws have been enacted to safeguard consumer rights across various sectors, encompassing transportation [16], finance [8], and telecommunications [3]. However, the precise applicability of these laws to parking attendants remains ambiguous. As consumers, encountering parking attendants who flout consumer protection laws can be exasperating and even distressing [15].

For instance, instances wherein parking attendants overcharge or unjustly levy fines can lead to unforeseen expenditures and feelings of exploitation. Consumers possess the entitlement to fair and reasonable service charges and expect businesses to treat them with honesty and transparency. Furthermore, encountering parking attendants who violate consumer protection regulations can undermine trust in the profession as a whole, fostering negative perceptions of parking attendants and dissuading consumers from availing their services. This could ultimately detrimentally impact local businesses and communities by reducing patronage in specific areas.

Furthermore, instances where consumers endure mistreatment or violence from parking attendants can precipitate emotional distress and physical harm. Consumers are entitled to respectful and dignified treatment from parking attendants, along with an assurance of safety and security when utilizing parking facilities. Violations of consumer protection

laws by parking attendants can inflict various harms upon consumers [4], ranging from financial losses to emotional anguish to diminished trust in the profession. Hence, enhancing consumer protection measures becomes imperative to shield consumers from unfair treatment and rights violations, fostering consumer confidence in utilizing parking services and fostering a secure and equitable parking environment for the wider community.

In this study, we will first review the relevant literature on consumer protection laws in Indonesia and their application to parking attendants, focusing on how these laws can benefit consumers. We will then describe the methods and procedures used to collect and analyze data on consumers' experiences with parking attendants, including any instances where consumer protection laws may have been violated.

By understanding consumers' perspectives and experiences, we hope to shed light on the challenges faced by consumers when dealing with parking attendants who may not abide by consumer protection laws. This study will inform future policy decisions and promote the development of more effective legal frameworks for protecting the rights of consumers who use parking services in Indonesia especially the city of Ambon. Findings will also provide important insights into the consumer attitudes and behaviors towards parking attendants, which can help inform marketing strategies for businesses in the parking industry. By better understanding consumer needs and concerns, businesses can develop more effective marketing campaigns and services that meet the expectations of their customers.

This research aims to provide valuable insights into Ambon's consumer protection landscape, specifically concerning the parking industry. By understanding consumers' perspectives, we hope to contribute to developing more effective policies and practices that better protect the rights of consumers and promote a more equitable and just business environment for parking attendants and consumers alike, and ultimately impact on business development.

METHODS

In this study, we employed a qualitative approach to collect and analyze data on consumers' experiences with parking attendants and the application of consumer protection laws in Indonesia. The use of a qualitative approach allowed for a comprehensive exploration of the experiences and perceptions of consumers with parking attendants and the application of consumer protection laws in Ambon. We used purposive sampling to select participants who had experience with parking attendants and may have encountered violations of consumer protection laws.

Data was collected through in-depth, semi-structured interviews with participants, which allowed for a comprehensive exploration of their experiences and perceptions. The results were then analyzed using thematic analysis, which involved identifying patterns and themes in the data. This allowed us to comprehensively understand consumers' experiences and the challenges they faced when dealing with parking attendants who may have violated consumer protection laws. The findings from this study will provide valuable insights into the challenges faced by consumers and can inform future policy decisions and marketing strategies for businesses in the parking industry.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The SERVQUAL approach is a well-established model for assessing service quality from the consumer's perspective [18]. It is based on the assumption that service quality is a function of the difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions of the service delivered [19]. This approach has been widely used in the marketing literature and has proven useful in evaluating service quality in a variety of industries. The SERVQUAL approach can be used to evaluate the level of service quality provided by parking attendants and to identify areas where consumer protection laws may have been violated. The five dimensions of service quality identified in the SERVQUAL approach are: Tangibles (the physical facilities, equipment, and appearance of the parking attendants); Reliability (the ability of the parking attendants to provide the service as promised and their dependability); Responsiveness (the willingness of the parking attendants to help customers and provide prompt service); Assurance (the knowledge and courtesy of the parking attendants and their ability to inspire trust and confidence in customers); and Empathy (the degree to which the parking attendants provide caring and individualized attention to customers).

By using the SERVQUAL approach, we can evaluate how well parking attendants in Indonesia are meeting these dimensions and identify any gaps between consumer expectations and actual experiences. This will allow us to identify areas where consumer protection laws may have been violated and develop strategies to improve service quality and protect the rights of consumers.

Furthermore, the SERVQUAL approach can also help inform marketing strategies for businesses [14], in this case the parking industry. By understanding consumer expectations and perceptions of service quality, businesses can develop more effective marketing campaigns and services that meet the expectations of their customers [22]. The SERVQUAL approach provides a solid theoretical basis for assessing service quality and identifying areas where consumer protection laws may have been violated in the context of parking attendants in Indonesia. Its five dimensions provide a framework for evaluating service quality and can help inform future policy decisions and marketing strategies for businesses in the parking industry.

Tangibles refers to the service provider's physical facilities, equipment, and appearance [9]. In the context of parking attendants in Ambon, tangibles might include the physical condition of the parking lot, the equipment used by the attendants (such as parking meters or ticket machines), and the attendants' appearance. Customers form expectations of a service based on the physical environment and appearance of the service provider [1]. For example, if a parking lot is poorly maintained, customers may perceive the service as low quality or unsafe. Similarly, if the parking attendants are disheveled or rude in appearance, this may also negatively impact the customers' perceptions of the service quality. By focusing on the tangibles dimension of service quality, businesses in the parking industry can identify areas where improvements can be made to enhance the customer experience. For example, improving the physical condition of the parking lot or providing better equipment for the attendants could lead to higher customer satisfaction and loyalty.

In the context of consumer protection laws, the tangibles dimension is also important because it can impact the safety and security of customers. Parking attendants have a responsibility to provide a safe and secure environment for customers to park their vehicles, and violations of consumer protection laws related to tangibles (such as inadequate maintenance of the parking lot) can result in harm or damage to customers' property. By focusing on the tangibles dimension and ensuring that consumer protection laws are being followed, parking attendants can provide a better, safer, and more secure service to their customers.

Reliability refers to the ability of the service provider to deliver the service as promised and in a consistent and dependable manner [17]. In the context of parking attendants in Ambon city, reliability might include the ability of the attendants to properly handle and park the customers' vehicles, to provide accurate and timely information about parking rates and rules, and to respond to customer inquiries and complaints in a prompt and professional manner. Customers form expectations of a service based on their previous experiences with the service provider [11]. If the parking attendants are inconsistent or unreliable in their service delivery, this can lead to a lack of trust in the service and a negative perception of the service quality.

By focusing on the reliability dimension of service quality, businesses in the parking industry can identify areas where improvements can be made to enhance the customer experience. For example, providing consistent training to parking attendants to ensure they are properly handling customer vehicles, implementing clear policies and procedures to ensure that customers receive accurate and timely information, and establishing effective communication channels for handling customer inquiries and complaints could lead to higher customer satisfaction and loyalty. In the context of consumer protection laws, the reliability dimension is also important because it can impact the fairness and transparency of the service provided to customers. Violations of consumer protection laws related to reliability [7], such as providing inaccurate or misleading information about parking rates can result in financial harm or confusion for customers. By focusing on the reliability dimension and ensuring that consumer protection laws are being followed, parking attendants can provide a more trustworthy, fair, and transparent service to their customers.

Responsiveness refers to the willingness and ability of the service provider to provide prompt and helpful service to its customers [20]. Responsiveness might include the ability of the attendants to quickly and efficiently park customers' vehicles, to provide assistance to customers who need help finding a parking spot, and to respond to customer inquiries and complaints in a friendly and helpful manner.

Customers form expectations of a service based on their interactions with the service provider [20]. If the parking attendants are unresponsive or unhelpful, this can lead to a negative perception of the service quality and a lack of trust in the service. By focusing on the responsiveness dimension of service quality, businesses in the parking industry can identify areas where improvements can be made to enhance the customer experience. For example, providing training to parking attendants on how to effectively communicate with customers, implementing clear policies and procedures for handling customer inquiries and complaints, and ensuring that parking attendants have the tools and

resources necessary to quickly and efficiently park customers' vehicles could lead to higher customer satisfaction and loyalty.

Responsiveness dimension is also important because it can impact the ability of customers to have their rights protected and their complaints addressed [2]. Violations of consumer protection laws related to responsiveness (such as failing to respond to customer complaints in a timely or helpful manner) can result in frustration or harm for customers. By focusing on the responsiveness dimension and ensuring that consumer protection laws are being followed, parking attendants can provide a more helpful, responsive, and customer-friendly service to their customers.

Assurance refers to the knowledge and competence of the service provider and their ability to convey trust and confidence to their customers [5]. In the context of parking attendants in Indonesia, assurance might include the ability of the attendants to demonstrate their knowledge of parking rules and regulations, to handle customers' vehicles with care and competence, and to communicate effectively with customers.

Customers form expectations of a service based on their perceptions of the service provider's expertise and professionalism (Nguyen et al., 2018). If the parking attendants are not knowledgeable, competent, or professional, this can lead to a negative perception of the service quality and a lack of trust in the service. By focusing on the assurance dimension of service quality, businesses in the parking industry can identify areas where improvements can be made to enhance the customer experience. For example, providing training to parking attendants on parking rules and regulations, implementing clear policies and procedures for handling customer vehicles, and ensuring that parking attendants have the tools and resources necessary to communicate effectively with customers could lead to higher customer satisfaction and loyalty.

Assurance dimension is also important because it can impact the ability of customers to trust that their rights are being protected and their vehicles are being handled competently and with care. Violations of consumer protection laws related to assurance (such as allowing untrained or unlicensed attendants to handle customers' vehicles) can result in harm or damage to customers' vehicles. By focusing on the assurance dimension and ensuring that consumer protection laws are being followed, parking attendants can provide a more trustworthy, competent, and professional service to their customers.

Empathy refers to the degree to which the service provider shows care, concern, and attentiveness to the customer's needs and expectations [21]. In the context of parking attendants, empathy might include the ability of the attendants to listen to customers' requests and concerns, to understand their needs and expectations, and to provide personalized service that meets those needs. Customers expect parking attendants to provide efficient and reliable parking services, but they also expect a certain level of personalized attention and care. When parking attendants are able to demonstrate empathy, it can lead to a positive perception of the service quality and a sense of satisfaction and loyalty among customers.

To improve the empathy dimension of service quality, parking attendants and businesses in the parking industry might focus on improving customer communication, training parking attendants to be more attentive and responsive to customers' needs, and implementing feedback mechanisms that allow customers to provide input on their

experiences. The empathy dimension is also important because it can impact the ability of customers to feel that their rights are being protected and that their concerns are being heard. By focusing on empathy, parking attendants can provide a more customer-centric service that meets the unique needs and expectations of their customers, and that demonstrates a commitment to protecting their rights under the law.

Study found that the five dimensions of service quality in the SERVQUAL approach (tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy) were all important to customers' perceptions of service quality in the parking industry in Ambon. Violations of consumer protection laws related to any of these dimensions can lead to harm to customers and a negative perception of service quality, highlighting the need for improved consumer protection measures in this industry.

In the study, the researchers examined the impact of the physical appearance of parking lots and the equipment used by parking attendants on customers' perceptions of service quality in the parking industry in Ambon. Results show that the physical appearance of parking lots, such as cleanliness and organization, and the equipment used by parking attendants, such as uniforms and handheld devices for issuing tickets, significantly impacted customers' perceptions of service quality. When the parking lot was well-maintained, and the parking attendants were properly equipped, customers were more likely to trust and feel confident in the service provided. This suggests that tangibles, one of the service quality dimensions in the SERVQUAL approach, played an important role in shaping customers' perceptions of service quality in the parking industry.

These findings have important implications for parking lot operators and policymakers in Indonesia. Findings suggest that investing in the physical appearance of parking lots and providing adequate equipment and training for parking attendants can lead to improved customer satisfaction and trust, which can ultimately benefit both the parking industry and consumers.

One of the dimensions of service quality in the SERVQUAL approach, in shaping customers' perceptions of service quality in the parking industry in Indonesia. Research found that customers placed a high value on reliability when it came to parking attendants' service. Customers expected parking attendants to provide efficient, accurate service and follow parking rules and regulations. When parking attendants were unreliable, such as by being late, providing incorrect information or issuing incorrect fines, it led to dissatisfaction and a negative perception of service quality. This suggests that reliability is a key factor that determines the quality of the service provided by parking attendants and significantly impacts customers' perceptions of service quality.

The findings have important implications for parking lot operators and policymakers in Indonesia. They suggest that reliability is an essential component of service quality in the parking industry, and efforts should be made to ensure that parking attendants provide accurate and efficient service while adhering to parking rules and regulations. Improving reliability in the parking industry can lead to increased customer satisfaction, ultimately benefiting both the parking industry and consumers.

Responsiveness refers to the ability of parking attendants to be available and attentive to customers' needs in a timely manner. In the context of parking services, customers expect parking attendants to be present and ready to assist them when they arrive and be available

to address any issues or concerns that may arise during the parking process. Research found that customers considered responsiveness as a key factor in their perceptions of service quality. Customers expected parking attendants to be prompt and responsive to their requests and needs, and when they were not, it led to dissatisfaction and a negative perception of service quality.

Therefore, it is important for parking attendants to be trained to provide timely and responsive service, and for employers to ensure that they have sufficient staffing to meet the needs of their customers. This can help improve customer satisfaction and contribute to a positive perception of service quality.

The assurance dimension of service quality is important to customers because it relates to their perception of the parking attendants' competency, knowledge, and professionalism. This study found that customers expected the parking attendants to be reliable and provide accurate information about parking rules and regulations. When customers perceived that parking attendants were not knowledgeable or competent, it led to negative perceptions of service quality and a lack of trust in the service. Violations of consumer protection laws related to assurance, such as using untrained or unlicensed attendants, also contributed to negative perceptions of service quality. Therefore, it is important for parking lot owners and managers to ensure that their attendants are properly trained and licensed, and that they are able to provide reliable and accurate information to customers.

The study also found that empathy was a key factor in customers' perceptions of service quality. Customers expected parking attendants to be attentive and responsive to their needs, and to demonstrate a caring and empathetic attitude. When parking attendants were unresponsive or lacked empathy, it led to dissatisfaction and a negative perception of service quality.

The study results demonstrate the importance of consumer protection laws and their effective implementation in ensuring the quality of service provided by parking attendants in Indonesia. Study found numerous violations of consumer protection laws by parking attendants, resulting in dissatisfaction among customers and negative perceptions of service quality. The SERVQUAL approach provided a useful framework for understanding the dimensions of service quality that are important to customers in the parking industry. The study found that all five dimensions (tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy) were critical to customer perceptions of service quality.

Study found that violations of consumer protection laws related to any of the five dimensions of service quality could lead to harm to customers and a negative perception of service quality. For example, violations related to tangibles, such as inadequate parking lot maintenance or poorly equipped attendants, led to a lack of confidence and trust in the service provided. Similarly, violations related to reliability, such as inefficient service or failure to follow regulations, led to dissatisfaction and negative perceptions of service quality.

Also, study found that effective implementation and enforcement of consumer protection laws could help to address the violations of service quality in the parking industry in Indonesia. Policymakers and employers must take action to ensure that parking attendants

are properly trained, equipped, and licensed to provide high-quality service to customers. Moreover, implementing complaint handling systems and redress mechanisms for customers can help improve accountability and transparency in the industry, and restore trust and confidence among customers.

The findings highlights the need for more effective and comprehensive consumer protection measures in the parking industry in Indonesia. Improved implementation and enforcement of consumer protection laws, along with effective complaint handling systems, can help address service quality violations and promote a more positive customer experience.

CONCLUSION

Findings provides a detailed analysis of the current state of consumer protection laws in the parking industry in Indonesia, and highlights the violations of service quality by parking attendants that lead to dissatisfaction and negative perceptions of service quality. The SERVQUAL approach helped to identify the five critical dimensions of service quality that are important to customers, including tangibles, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy. Study found that any violations of consumer protection laws related to any of these dimensions could lead to harm to customers and a negative perception of service quality.

The study also identified several factors that contribute to the violations of service quality in the parking industry in Indonesia, such as inadequate training, lack of licensing, and inefficient regulation. Policymakers and employers must take action to address these factors and ensure that parking attendants are properly trained, equipped, and licensed to provide high-quality service to customers.

Furthermore, the study suggests that the implementation of complaint handling systems and redress mechanisms for customers can help to improve accountability and transparency in the industry, and restore trust and confidence among customers. The urgent need for improved implementation and enforcement of consumer protection laws in the parking industry in Indonesia. By addressing service quality violations and promoting a more positive customer experience, policymakers and employers can help create a more trustworthy and reliable parking industry in Indonesia.

REFERENCES

- [1] Ali, Bayad Jamal, et al. "Hotel service quality: The impact of service quality on customer satisfaction in hospitality." Ali, BJ, Gardi, B., Othman, BJ, Ahmed, SA, Ismael, NB, Hamza, PA, Aziz, HM, Sabir, BY, Anwar, G.(2021). Hotel Service Quality: The Impact of Service Quality on Customer Satisfaction in Hospitality. *International Journal of Engineering, Business and Management* 5.3: 14-28, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.22161/ijebm.5.3>
- [2] Ashfaq, Muhammad, et al. "I, Chatbot: Modeling the determinants of users' satisfaction and continuance intention of AI-powered service agents." *Telematics and Informatics* 54: 101473, 2020. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2020.101473>
- [3] Barkatullah, Abdul Halim. "Does self-regulation provide legal protection and security to e-commerce consumers?." *Electronic Commerce Research and*

- Applications 30: 94-101, 2018.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.elerap.2018.05.008>
- [4] Belwal, Rakesh, Rahima Al Shibli, and Shweta Belwal. "Consumer protection and electronic commerce in the Sultanate of Oman." *Journal of Information, Communication and Ethics in Society* 19.1: 38-60, 2021.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/JICES-09-2019-0110>
- [5] Cheng, Xusen, Shixuan Fu, and Gert-Jan De Vreede. "A mixed method investigation of sharing economy driven car-hailing services: Online and offline perspectives." *International Journal of Information Management* 41: 57-64, 2018.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2018.03.005>
- [6] Choi, Youngjoon, et al. "Service robots in hotels: understanding the service quality perceptions of human-robot interaction." *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management* 29.6: 613-635, 2020.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/19368623.2020.1703871>
- [7] Mehta, Mihir P., Gopal Kumar, and M. Ramkumar. "Customer expectations in the hotel industry during the COVID-19 pandemic: a global perspective using sentiment analysis." *Tourism Recreation Research* 48.1: 110-127, 2023.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2021.1894692>
- [8] Muryanto, Yudho Taruno, Dona Budi Kharisma, and Anjar Sri Ciptorukmi Nugraheni. "Prospects and challenges of Islamic fintech in Indonesia: a legal viewpoint." *International Journal of Law and Management* 64.2: 239-252, 2022.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/IJLMA-08-2020-0233>
- [9] Nahida Afroz, Nushrat. "Effect of service quality on customer satisfaction evidence from banks in Tangail." *Management studies and economic systems* 4.2: 145-159, 2019.
- [10] Nguyen, Quang, et al. "Understanding customer satisfaction in the UK quick service restaurant industry: The influence of the tangible attributes of perceived service quality." *British Food Journal* 120.6: 1207-1222, 2018.
<https://doi.org/10.1108/BFJ-08-2017-0449>
- [11] Nobar, Hossein Bodaghi Khajeh, and Reza Rostamzadeh. "The impact of customer satisfaction, customer experience and customer loyalty on brand power: empirical evidence from hotel industry." *Journal of Business Economics and Management* 19.2: 417-430, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.3846/jbem.2018.5678>
- [12] Omonov, F. A. "The important role of intellectual transport systems in increasing the economic efficiency of public transport services." *Academic research in educational sciences* 3.3: 36-40, 2022. <https://doi.org/10.24412/2181-1385-2022-3-36-40>
- [13] Parmar, Janak, Pritikana Das, and Sanjaykumar M. Dave. "Study on demand and characteristics of parking system in urban areas: A review." *Journal of Traffic and Transportation Engineering (English Edition)* 7.1: 111-124, 2020.
- [14] Raza, Syed Ali, et al. "Internet banking service quality, e-customer satisfaction and loyalty: the modified e-SERVQUAL model." *The TQM Journal* 32.6: 1443-1466, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1108/TQM-02-2020-0019>
- [15] Reessena, Zernis Cendramata, and Padrisan Jamba. "Legal protection for parking services in the event of a motor vehicle loss." *Jurnal Cakrawala Hukum* 13.2 (2022): 224-230.

- [16] Said, Lambang Basri, and Ilham Syafey. "The scenario of reducing congestion and resolving parking issues in Makassar City, Indonesia." *Case Studies on Transport Policy* 9.4: 1849-1859, 2021. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cstp.2021.10.004>
- [17] Shankar, Amit, and Charles Jebarajakirthy. "The influence of e-banking service quality on customer loyalty: A moderated mediation approach." *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 37.5: 1119-1142, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJBM-03-2018-0063>
- [18] Shi, Zhengyu, and Huifang Shang. "A review on quality of service and servqual model." *HCI in Business, Government and Organizations: 7th International Conference, HCIBGO 2020, Held as Part of the 22nd HCI International Conference, HCII 2020, Copenhagen, Denmark, July 19–24, 2020, Proceedings 22*. Springer International Publishing, 2020.
- [19] Souri, Mohammad Ehsan, et al. "Grey SERVQUAL method to measure consumers' attitudes towards green products-A case study of Iranian consumers of LED bulbs." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 177: 187-196, 2018. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.12.105>
- [20] Su, Yaohua, and Weichen Teng. "Contemplating museums' service failure: Extracting the service quality dimensions of museums from negative on-line reviews." *Tourism Management* 69: 214-222, 2018. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2018.06.020>
- [21] Tan, Adrian Heng Tsai, Birgit Muskat, and Raechel Johns. "The role of empathy in the service experience." *Journal of Service Theory and Practice* 29.2: 142-164, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSTP-10-2018-0221>
- [22] Uzir, Md Uzir Hossain, et al. "The effects of service quality, perceived value and trust in home delivery service personnel on customer satisfaction: Evidence from a developing country." *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services* 63: 102721, 2021. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2021.102721>